

Plans Panel (City Centre)

Thursday, 10th September, 2009

PRESENT: Councillor M Hamilton in the Chair (part)

Councillors D Blackburn, Mrs R Feldman,
T Hanley, G Latty, J McKenna,
J Monaghan and E Nash

23 Declarations of Interest

The following members declared personal/prejudicial interests for the purpose of Section 81(3) of the Local Government Act 2000 and paragraph 8 to 12 of the Members Code of Conduct

Application No. 09/02351/FU – The Orange Zone Car Park – University of Leeds – Councillor Nash declared personal interest as a Member of English Heritage which had commented on the proposal (Minute No. 26 refers)

Application No. 09/02351/FU - The Orange Zone Car Park – University of Leeds – Councillor Monaghan declared personal interest as a Member of Leeds Civic Trust which had commented on the proposal (Minute No. 26 refers)

Application No. 09/03060/FU – Land off Vernon Road, Woodhouse – Position Statement Application – University of Leeds – Councillor Monaghan declared personal interest as a Member of Leeds Civic Trust which had commented on the proposal (Minute No. 27 refers)

Application No. 09/02351/FU – The Orange Zone Car Park – University of Leeds – Councillor Hamilton declared personal and prejudicial interest through his employment at Leeds University who are the applicants (Minute No. 26 refers)

Application No. 09/03060/FU – Land off Vernon Road, Woodhouse – Position Statement Application – University of Leeds – Councillor Hamilton declared personal and prejudicial interest through his employment at Leeds University who are the applicants (Minute No. 27 refers)

Application No. 09/02430/FU – Land off Woodhouse Lane and Clarendon Road, Leeds 2 - University of Leeds – Councillor Hamilton declared personal and prejudicial interest through his employment at Leeds University who are the applicants (Minute No. 28 refers)

24 Apologies for Absence

There were no apologies for absence

25 Minutes

RESOLVED – That the minutes of the Plans Panel City Centre meeting held on 13th August 2009 be approved

COUNCILLOR HAMILTON VACATED THE CHAIR

Having declared personal and prejudicial interests in items nos; 7,8 and 9 (minutes No. 26, 27 and 28 refers) Councillor Hamilton vacated Chair and left the meeting, Councillor Latty assumed the Chair

26 Application 09/02351/FU - The Orange Zone car park, University of Leeds off Woodhouse Lane LS2

Plans, photographs, graphics and sample materials were displayed at the meeting. Members had previously received two informal pre-application presentations and a position statement on the scheme. The scheme had been amended to reflect Members comments, section 5.0 of the submitted report refers.

Officers presented a report which set out details of an application for the erection of an eight storey rectilinear building to form a university business and innovation centre, to be known as the Innovation City Leeds (ICL) building. Facilities within the building include a media theatre and video conferencing, an innovation suite, networking spaces and a café, and combined enterprise and innovation offices. The building is to be set in an area of hard and soft landscaping. The location of the proposed development is on the site of the Orange Zone Car Park, University of Leeds off Woodhouse Lane, Leeds 2.

Detailed information was provided on the proposal in relation to the following issues:

- Location of the proposal in relation to the inner ring road
- East West access arrangements
- A prominent site within the University complex
- The proposed tree coverage for the site (loss of 92 to be replaced by 66 creating a larger area of amenity space)
- The deterioration of the car park surface and the anticipated short life of the existing trees
- Details of the various floor plans was provided
- The roof of the building to incorporate photovoltaic panels providing up to 10% of the buildings energy requirements
- An explanation of the solar shade was provided as part of the explanation of the building's elevations

Members sought clarification on the following matters:

- Would the proposed glass louvre system be set in a fixed position?

minutes approved at the meeting
held on Thursday, 8th October, 2009

- Would any of the existing trees within the car park area, be protected, what was the overall loss of trees and could further discussions take place on the type of trees to be planted?
- There was concern with the loss of mature trees in this area
- Concern that the building could be too transparent
- Why are the colours to the glass louvers limited to shades of blue?
- Maintenance of the building, cleaning of the glass surfaces

The following responses were provided:

- The external glass louvre system would be set in a fixed position. Consideration had been given for the louvres to be connected to a sun tracking system but this was not considered worthwhile as the energy used to operate them was almost equal to the energy saved
- The trees within the car park were planted within brick borders many of which bulged in places due to tree growth. Given the deterioration of a number of the trees and their age it was considered not feasible that these trees should be retained. In terms of number of trees, there would be a slight net loss (92 removed to be replaced with 66) but the quality of the new trees was much improved and more functional . Also additional trees would be planted on the adjacent multi-storey car park site which would create a net loss of 18 trees over the two sites
- For future University proposals an audit could be undertaken to demonstrate the potential for additional tree planting within the public realm enhancements on a campus wide basis
- Blue shades of glass would provide the optimum solar shading for the building. The angles of the glazing louvers allows light to be reflected creating a cut glass look which should restrict transparency and provide visual interest
- In terms of maintenance of the glass surfaces, the building had been designed so as to create gaps between the windows and louvres to allow access for maintenance purposes

Members expressed their thanks to officers for the work they had undertaken on this scheme and to the developers for their willingness to take on board the comments made by Members

RESOLVED – To approve the application in principal and to defer and delegate final approval to the Chief Planning Officer subject to the conditions specified in the submitted report , with the inclusion of additional conditions relating to:

- A 5 year landscape maintenance programme
- Provision for replacement of trees if dead or uprooted
- Preservation of existing trees around the perimeter of the development site
- Protection of existing trees and other vegetation around the perimeter of the site
- Further negotiations on the species of replacement trees

and the completion of a legal agreement within 3 months from the date of resolution unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Chief Planning Officer to include the following obligations:

- (i) A public transport infrastructure improvements contribution of £97,748.00
- (ii) A Green Travel Plan monitoring and evaluation fee of £2500.00
- (iii) Employment and training of local people
- (iv) Agreement to off site public realm works to the Parkinson Entrance to the campus and land at the end of Hillary Place
- (v) Public access areas
- (vi) The identification of an area of land upon which a future public footbridge across the Leeds Ring Road could be landed
- (vii) An agreement to contribute £20,000.00 to traffic regulation orders should it prove that they are required as a result of the proposal

27 Application 09/03060/FU - Off Vernon Road Woodhouse LS2

Plans, photographs, graphics and sample materials were displayed at the meeting. Members had previously received three informal pre-application presentations and a position statement on the scheme. The scheme had been amended to reflect Members comments, section 5.0 of the submitted report refers.

Officers presented a report which set out a position statement for the development of a 10 storey car park with associated management suite and ancillary (Class D1/ Cycle Hire and Workshop) space and landscaping to land off Vernon Road, Woodhouse Leeds 2

Detailed information was provided on the proposal in relation to the following issues:

- The relationship with the Innovation Building development
- Proposed car parking spaces (607 spaces)
- Bicycle parking
- Loss of surface car park areas (360 spaces)
- Explanation of the phasing of the two buildings
- Landscaping routes around the building proposed and existing
- Access arrangements
- Negotiations were currently ongoing about the level of trees to be retained
- Green elevations and climbing plants (green wall)
- Floor plans; base level car parking plus higher level parking, photovoltaic panels to be sited on roof
- The design of the exterior panels and the use of ventilation holes
- Cladding and support options
- Sustainability - Use of tree planting & landscaping, reuse of excavated materials and use of photovoltaic panels
- Requirements of a Section 016 Agreement to include:

- (i) Agreement to off site public realm works to the Parkinson Entrance to the campus and land at the end of Hillary Place The agreement of publicly accessible areas within the landscaped scheme
- (ii) The employment and training of local people
- (iii) The identification of an area of land upon which a future foot bridge across the Leeds Inner Ring Road could be landed
- (iv) A contribution to off site highway works to create a Toucan crossing to the south of the junction of Fenton Street and Woodhouse lane of a sum to be agreed

It was confirmed that contrary to the officer report there would not be a Section 106 requirement for a green travel plan

Members sought clarification on the following matters:

- How would the gabion features retain sufficient soil for planting
- Positioning of the photovoltaic panels and their contribution to the energy requirements for the building

The following responses were provided:

- The photovoltaic panels would be fixed at an angle to maximise solar gain and may provide up to 10% of the buildings energy requirements (this would be clarified with the applicant)
- The proposed wall planting would be rooted in a soil trench at the base of the gabions, which would only provide a climbing structure for the plants

Members comments:

- Overtime the colour of the exterior panels may fade following exposure to sunlight. Unpleasant odours may emanate from the carbon fibre panels, lining the back of the panel could assist in reducing the odour
- The proposed grey colour for the exterior panels may look dull in the winter months
- The use of ventilation holes in the exterior panels may produce noise in windy conditions
- The protrusion of the lift shaft above the roof detracts from the appearance of the building
- Further consideration of the species of trees and more strategic planting would be required
- Further details on the energy savings for the building
- Handling of the top course of panels

The Chief Planning Officer reported that the following issues would be raised with the applicant:

- Further information on the level of energy savings
- The ventilation holes in the exterior panels and possible wind implications

- The longevity of the external panels, possible odours and maintenance implications
- Colour of exterior panels questionable, consider colours/ materials used on Innovation Building
- The appearance of the lift shaft
- The number and species of trees

RESOLVED – To note the report, the presentation and the comments now made

28 Application 09/02430/FU - University of Leeds Woodhouse Lane and Clarendon Road Woodhouse LS2

Plans, photographs, graphics and sample materials were displayed at the meeting. Members had previously received an informal pre-application presentation on the scheme. The scheme had been amended to reflect Members comments, section 5.0 of the submitted report refers.

Officers presented a report which set out details of the application which included the demolition of pilot plant building and construction of a new 4 storey research laboratory building with office accommodation at the rear of the Houldsworth Building, University of Leeds, Woodhouse Lane and Clarendon Road, Woodhouse , Leeds 2

Detailed information was provided on the proposal in relation to the following issues:

- The location of the proposal within the University campus
- Access arrangements
- An explanation of the floor plans and the type of facilities that would be included on each level
- The elevations of the building to consist of bronze metallic cladding
- Eastern elevation to be finished in red brick and metal mesh, brise soleil to be added to the recessed windows of the south and south west elevations
- Pedestrian areas to be enhanced
- Paving improvement scheme
- The Section 106 agreement request to include two replacement bus shelters on Clarendon Road has now been agreed by the applicant

Members sought clarification on the following matters:

- Would photovoltaics be included within the development?
- Possibility of an additional tree within St Georges Field to enhance views at the boundary wall

The following responses were provided:

- No photovoltaics were proposed to be included within the development. However the development aims to achieve a BREEAM target of very good which is considered acceptable for the scale and nature of the proposals. The details of how this would be achieved would be controlled by condition

- The request for a further tree within St.Georges Field will be raised with the applicant

Members comments:

- Would like further discussions on the use of photovoltaics
- Support the provision of new bus shelters
- Support enhanced pedestrian areas

Members expressed their thanks to officers for the work they had undertaken on this scheme and to the developers for their willingness to take on board the comments made by Members

RESOLVED – To approve the application in principal and to defer and delegate final approval to the Chief Planning Officer subject to the conditions specified in the submitted report and the completion of a legal agreement within 3 months from the date of resolution unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Chief Planning Officer to include the following obligations:

- Public Transport contribution of £26,486
- Travel Plan with monitoring fee of £2,500
- Two replacement bus shelters on Clarendon Road at a total cost of £20,000
- Agreement to contribute £20,000 if there is any detrimental impact on surrounding communities from the loss of car parking (to span a 10 year period)
- Commitment to use reasonable endeavours to cooperate with LCC Jobs and Skills Service during post construction regarding employment at the site and use local contractors, sub –contractors and material suppliers
- £600 monitoring fee for each clause that requires administration/ management/ monitoring (public transport contribution, off site parking contribution)

29 Date and time of next meeting

Thursday 8th October 2009 at 1.30pm